

## **Historic Zoning Commission Removal-Replacement Checklist**

6/2012

### **Questions when deciding to remove features or materials**

- Is the feature/material character-defining-significantly contributing to the style and helping to determine the era of the structure?
- Is the feature a unique artistic expression, or is it common and utilitarian?
- Will the character of the structure be altered significantly if the feature/material is removed? (Mis-represents historic design trends?)
- Is the feature/material original, early or added late? (evidence?)
- Has the original/early feature/material been altered? (evidence?)
- Is the feature/material prominently visible from the sidewalk or street?
- Was the feature later constructed with shoddy and low-quality materials and exhibiting an ill-conceived design?

### **Questions when deciding to replace or add features or materials**

- Does the proposed feature/material cause the structure to look earlier or later than its original era?
- Does the proposed feature/material alter the style of the structure?
- Does the proposed feature overwhelm/detract from the façade design and make a major statement that overshadows the design of the early structure (overly “fancy” or prominent)?
- Is the proposed feature/material prominently visible from the sidewalk or street?
- Is the proposed feature/material typical of those found on other structures in the district or indicated in academic architectural history manuals? (Should not be the only basis to approve adding a feature.)

### **Removing/adding features/materials *only* on the following bases is NOT justification for approval, though these results *may* be an outcome:**

- It improves the appearance or aesthetics of the structure.
- It accommodates the owner’s needs for the inside of the structure.
- It will make the structure look more like others in the district.

### **The burden of proof is on the applicant with regard to the following:**

- What original features/materials existed on a structure
- Appropriateness of/reasons for a removing or replacing features/materials
- Appropriateness of/reasons for adding features/materials not documented as originally existing